A Study of Students' Subtitling Project on "Ambilkan Bulan" Movie

Esriaty S. Kendenan
Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana, Salatiga, Indonesia. Email: esriaty.kendenan@staff.uksw.edu

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
	This paper aims at investigating how student subtitlers practice making subtitle of "Ambilkan Bulan" movie from Indonesian into English. This subtitling project is expected to help students sharpen their translation skills while learning linguistic and cultural aspects of both Indonesian as the source language (SL) and English as the target language (TL) in this study. In addition, students are also expected to have more practices on the technical aspects of subtitle to convey the message in the limited time and space by applying existing subtitle software. The data of this study were taken from students' translations in Subtitling class. The data were analyzed descriptively to identify the strategy used by students based on Gottlieb's ten subtitle strategies and the technical constraints they commonly faced in making the subtitle. The results of this study indicate that students generally apply all of these strategies with varying frequencies and linguistics-related problems. Transcription strategy is the most frequent strategy applied by the students. This study also shows that students still struggle with the technical aspects related to cueing duration, rhythm, and division of subtitle which are sometimes less synchronous and eventually distracted viewers' convenience.

1. Introduction

Audio Visual Translation (AVT) has played an important role in social life, either in the form of subtitling, lip-sync, dubbing, or voice-over. Some television programs in Indonesia, especially related to foreign news or films, are mostly making use of subtitling rather than other modes of AVT. Therefore, it can be denied that subtitling has been popular among Indonesian viewers.

As translation in general, subtitling can become a medium to bridge communication across nations through language. In addition, it can also become the medium to share ideas and to introduce a way of life as well as cultural values from one part of the world to another.

It is necessary somehow to introduce and promote Indonesian culture (artifact) to people or audience in other countries through various media or program. Film is one example of the work of arts that can meet this objective. Asian films, like Korean and Indian, have attracted many viewers not only in their own country but also from other Asian countries, even from other continents. This achievement should also motivate Indonesian film producers to introduce their films abroad. It should be noted that Indonesian people have always become the consumer of foreign films for years, though some film producers have made a collaboration with foreign actors/actresses, producers and director recently.

In that way, subtitling is one thing needed to promote Indonesian culture through film or documented program to people from other countries, especially in the English countries. Therefore, using Indonesian film as one subtitling project for student subtitlers would be beneficial for a student to have valuable experience in making English subtitle besides Indonesian subtitle.

By considering its popularity, "Ambilkan Bulan" musical film was chosen as the final group project for Subtitling class. The film is famous and interesting not only because of its story but also because of its familiar soundtrack for most Indonesian people, especially children. By making the English subtitle of the movie, the student subtitlers will learn more and get a deeper insight into the world of subtitling. For Indonesian viewers, in general, the English subtitle may help them to learn English through film. So, they will not only spend their time for the purpose of entertaining themselves, but also for getting information and learning English language. Whereas, for non-Indonesian viewers, the subtitling will provide them with information about Indonesian way of life, culture, values, language, nature, music, and many more.

Due to the important contribution of subtitling subject to bridge global interaction, more discussion on linguistics and technical constraints is still needed. Subtitling has its own challenging in the process of translation. The challenge may arise problems in translating or making the subtitling not only for the student subtitlers but even for the professional subtitlers. Considering that fact, this research would try to find out problems that students may face while translating several aspects of language and their strategies to cope with the problems.

This study is conducted to find out general strategies used by the students in translating Indonesian dialogues into English subtitle for "Ambilkan Bulan" movie as a whole by referring to Gottlieb's ten strategies for film subtitling. Besides, It also wants to discover technical problems that students faced in doing the project. The result of the study hopefully will bring a significant contribution to translation studies, study program, teacher, and student-subtitlers themselves. To translation studies, this study will reveal the special characteristics of AVT in comparison with different types of translation (i.e. printed media) and to make use literary translation in the AVT and the problems may arise. To the study program, this study aims to identify the needs for the development of AVT in an academic setting, especially in developing curriculum in order to fulfill students' needs and eventually to accommodate community's needs for a good subtitle – both into Indonesian and into English. To teachers, this study can be helpful to reflect then to evaluate the teaching-learning process (syllabus, lesson plans, material/handout, and multimedia, etc.) as a whole. To student subtitlers, this study will help them to identify their main problems in translating for subtitle and to find the solutions for the problems in order to improve their skills in subtitling.

Literature Review

This literature review begins by giving a brief definition of subtitling then explaining subtitling strategy and subtitler competence.
Maria Pavesi and Elisa Perego in Cintas (2008: 215-216) mention that:

> Audiovisual subtitles are known to be a written translation or transcription – printed at the bottom of the screen – of the spoken dialogue of any TV or cinema product. The form of subtitles is interconnected to their function and determines the potential target audience. The

standard interlingual type is typically used as a form of translation which allows the distribution of a film in a foreign market while the intralingual type is mainly employed for the deaf and the hard-of-hearing.

In a simpler way, Henrik Gottlieb in Ivarsson (2013) defines subtitling as "*diagonal translation*" from the spoken to the written mode in one hand, and interlingual subtitling as "*being two-dimensional, 'jaywalks'* [crosses over] *from source-language speech to target-language writing*" on the other hand.

According to Henrik Gottlieb (2004) interlingual subtitling in its societal and language-political implications can become an important instrument in: 1) Improving reading skills; 2) Boosting foreign language skills; 3) (Ideally) facilitating easy and cheap international program exchange; and 4) (In reality) cementing the dominance of English.

Without ignoring the four important benefits of the interlingual subtitling as a whole, this study is focused on the function of the second and third benefits of subtitle namely to boost foreign language skills, especially for student subtitlers and to facilitate an easy and cheap international exchange program.

In a similar way, Blane, as cited by Kruger in Cintas (2008:79), said that:

> interlingual subtitling has a significant motivational quality which 'engages students' interest and enthusiasm, promotes confidence and security, fosters the development of L2 learning strategies and translation strategies and offers additional benefits in the form of transferable skills, relevant to the professional activities of the present and future.

In the study of subtitling, it is important to understand applicable strategies and competencies need to be possessed by subtitler to make a subtitling project.

Mona Baker (2001:245) mentions four channels that need to be considered by the translator in Audio Visual Translation (AVT) for movies or television programs, namely 1) the verbal auditory channel; 2) the non-verbal auditory channel; 3) the verbal-visual channel, and 4) and the non-verbal visual channel. For subtitling, channels 1, 2, and 3 are the most important. However, for the purposes of this research, the major concern will be on the translation of dialogue and soundtrack as part of the verbal auditory channel.

Gottlieb in Garheim & Benyamin (2010) identifies ten strategies for subtitling films that are usually applied by subtitlers. The strategies are: 1) Expansion, an additional explanation in the target language due to the different cultural nuance between source and target language; 2) Paraphrase, as different syntactic way to reconstruct phraseology in the target language; 3) Transfer, a strategy to translate the source text completely and accurately; 4) Imitation, the use of similar forms, especially for the names of people and places; 5) Transcription, the use of the third language for unusual terms; 6) Dislocation, the adoption of some special effects from the source text to preserve the expected effect in the target text; 7) Condensation, the strategy to shorten the text; 8) Decimation, an extreme form of condensation that may cause the omission of some important parts; 9) Deletion, the total elimination of parts of a text; 10) Resignation, is used when no translation solution can be found and meaning is inevitably lost.

In practice, a subtitler might only use a few of the ten strategies in translating for subtitle in accordance with the content, form, house style of the media where the text (film/television program subtitle) is presented, etc. The main reason to apply

certain strategies is the limited number of characters and lines that can be displayed simultaneously on the screen.

By referring to the views of Makarian and Pošta, Emilia Janecová (2012) mentions four competencies that need to be owned by a subtitler, namely professional competence, language or linguistic competence, cultural competence, and technical competence. Nevertheless, in evaluating subtitling project, Jan-Louis Kruger in Cintas (2008:84) pays more attention to the linguistic and technical competences as the minimum assessment criteria. Therefore, it can be said that to be a skillful subtitler one has to have at least those two competences. The competence in linguistics is measured by focusing on the appropriateness or accuracy of the content and language of the subtitle in relation to the utterances in the source text, including the use of mechanics. On the other hand, technical competence is more about the cueing of duration, rhythm, segmentation of dialogue and its subtitles, etc.

2. Methods

In this paper, the term student subtitler is used to refer to the students who took the subtitling class and involved as the participant in this study. In translating the Indonesian dialogues and then transcribing the English subtitle of the film as a whole, students definitely apply some strategies. Thus, this study is going to find out and analyze strategies students employ to make the subtitle for the film by referring to Henrik Gottlieb's ten subtitling strategies.

The data of this research were taken from students' English subtitle on "Ambilkan Bulan" Movie by making use of Subtitle Edit software. To obtain the information needed for this research, the researcher has followed this general procedure. First, viewing the films; second, transcribing the Indonesian utterances and the English subtitles of the film translated by the students; third, collecting data to answer the research questions by identifying and then classifying subtitling strategies used by students especially on several important aspects to consider; finally, analyzing the data to describe the strategies used by students in making the subtitle and to identify technical constraints they experience while making the subtitle.

3. Findings

Based on the students' subtitling project, it is found that students faced some problems in translating the film subtitle both in linguistic and technical aspects.

3.1. Linguistic Aspect

Translation from mother tongue as a source language into a foreign language as the target language may arise problems for the subtitlers. The problems are actually common for every subtitler. In coping the problems, translators, in general, would automatically apply certain strategies. In terms of making the English subtitle of "Ambilkan Bulan" movie, students seem to apply the 10 strategies of subtitling proposed by Gottlieb. The ST and TT in the following data analysis are distinguished by giving the letter a to refer to the ST and b to the TT.

3.1.1. Transcription Strategy

The highest frequency of those 10 strategies that commonly used by students in making the English subtitles of the movie is transcription strategy. This strategy is

used in students' subtitle where a term is unusual even in the source text, for example, the use of a third language or nonsense language. Students frequently applied this strategy especially for some address terms in the source text that come from Javanese (local) and Arabic languages. As a matter of fact, most terms have been included in the KBBI as the part of standard Indonesian vocabularies. Some of them are presented in the following examples:

(1a) "Is Ambar home <u>budhe</u>?"

(1b) "Ambar ada di rumah gak ya <u>budhe</u>?"

(2a) "No, we're not. Right, <u>bukne</u>?"

(2b) "Enggak khan <u>bukne</u>?"

(3a) "<u>Allahu Akbar</u>!"

(3b) "<u>Allahu Akbar</u>!"

(4a) "<u>Assalamualaikum</u>"

(4b) "<u>Assalamualaikum</u>"

The Javanese words like *budhe* and *bukne* are usually used by Javanese people to address woman, i.e. *budhe* for aunt (elder sister of our father or mother) and *bukne* as the way a Javanese man addresses his wife. The Arabic terms such as *Allahu Akbar* and *Assalamualaikum* which are familiar enough to Indonesian people and have been widely used as loan words in Indonesian vocabulary are also maintained in the English subtitle.

Other words like *mas*, *mbak*, *pakde*, *kang*, *lebaran*, *mbah* actually also derive from Javanese language but then have been acceptable as the part of Indonesian vocabularies. Similarly, the terms like *magrib*, *walaikumsalam*, etc. originally come from Arabic language but have also been listed in KBBI. The addressing term like *Bu Ne* is an example of Javanese addressing term that has not been included in Indonesian standard vocabulary because it can't be found in KBBI. The word *ojek* that according to KBBI comes from Jakarta dialect has been also considered as the part of Indonesian language. Other Indonesian words that have been transcribed into the English subtitle of the film by student subtitlers are *pak*, *bik* (informal language).

Javanese words used in the English subtitle are greater in number in comparison with Arabic or Indonesian standard vocabularies. It might be because the student subtitlers are mostly Javanese and have been familiar with the language, so they do not think that those words should be translated into English as the target language of the translation. Besides that, they might also think that through this film subtitle, people around the world (the non-Indonesian/Javanese viewer) will be exposed and introduced with Javanese language and culture.

For some words which come from Arabic language, the transcription might happen not only because they have been familiar enough to moslem community, but also because they are typical for them. The number of those Arabic-origin words are great, yet they are still fewer than Javanese origin terms. Indonesian words in this students' English subtitling project are much fewer. It happens might be because most Indonesian words have had equivalence in English. Hence, students do not really strive too much to find their equivalence in English.

3.1.2. Condensation Strategy

This strategy has been the second highest frequently used strategy in students' subtitling. In oral communication, it is commonly acceptable to apply the shortening form of the language either in the form of word, phrase, or sentence. The shortening of the text is mostly applied by the student subtitlers in form of the deletion of part of the text, deletion of the subject, deletion of (direct) object, deletion of addressing term, and deletion of some repetitive words or expressions.

a) *The deletion of part of text*

The deletion of part of text can be identified in the following expressions:

(1a) "Mana anak Papa <u>mau sekolah</u>"

(1b) "Where's daddy's girl?"

The information about what the little girl is going to do, i.e. "mau sekolah" is deleted by student subtitler.

Another example is:

(2a) "Dulu ibuku <u>pamit </u>ke Jakarta"

(2b) "She went to Jakarta"

The student subtitlers chose to use pronoun 'she' that referring to '*ibuku'* (my mother) in one hand and omit '*pamit'* (ask permission) on the other hand from the sentence. The use of "she" instead of "my mother" has reduced the kinship relationship between the speaker and the object of narration. The omission of "ask permission" or "pamit" as the predicate of this sentence that actually shows more specific situation at the time the dialogue took place.

The deletion of part of sentence such as subject, object, or addressing terms is also found in students' subtitling.

b) *The deletion of subject*

The deletion of subject can be found in several parts of the subtitling. It can be seen in the following examples:

(3a) "Aku kayaknya telat dikit nih meetingnya"

(3b) "Seems that I'll be late for the meeting"

(4a) "Ya sebaiknya tunggu sampai besok"

(4b) "better wait until tomorrow"

The subject 'it' in extract 3b is deleted by student subtitlers to shorten the utterances. While in extract 4b, the deletion is not only on the subject 'it' but also on its predicate 'is'.

c) *The deletion of (direct) object*

(5a) "Terus kenapa mama tidak pernah cerita soal eyang ...?"

(5b) "So why she never told about you?"

As a transitive verb, 'told' should be followed by a direct object, which is 'me' in this context. However, the object has been deleted by student subtitler might be for the sake of shortening the utterance or because it doesn't appear explicitly in its source text.

d) *The deletion of addressing term*

(6a) "Wow, itu fotonya kemarin dikirim ke aku <u>pakde</u>"

(6b) "Look! That is the place Ambar sent me a picture of!"

(7a) "<u>kang </u>jadi ganti hape baru yang ada kameranya gak?"

(7b) "Have you change your mobile with the one with camera?"
(8a) "Aku memang nggak pernah disandera siapa-siapa, <u>kakek</u>"
(8b) "I've never been kidnapped"
(9a) "Rumah siapa <u>Min</u>?"
(9b) "Whose house is it?"

The addressing terms *pakde*, *kang*, *kakek*, and the proper name 'Min' were deleted by student subtitlers from the target text. However, the deletion is still acceptable because the viewers of the movie have access to the movie, so they may directly identify to whom the speaker was talking to or addressing the speech. Besides, the use of addressing terms at the end of an utterance is unnatural in English as the target language.

3.1.3. Transfer Strategy

This strategy, in which the subtitler translating the source text completely and accurately, is also applied by student subtitlers several times in making the subtitle of the film. Below are examples of the use of this strategy.

(1a) "Memang dulunya temanan dimana?"
(1b) "Where did they meet at first?"
(2a) "Kamu kan bisa dengar penjelasan mama dulu"
(2b) "You could've listen to her first."
(3a) "Habis itu dikirim ke Arab Saudi."
(3b) "Then they sent her to Saudi Arabia."
(4a) "Matur suwun njeeh."
(4b) "Thank you very much."
(5a) "Siap!"
(5b) "Sir!"

Student subtitlers are successful enough to understand and transfer the message that the script writer wanted to convey into English as the target language of this film subtitling. The above extracts are some examples of utterances in which student subtitlers showed how they have managed to transfer the message skillfully without being tied to the form or word for word translation. Even, the example 4a and 4b show that student subtitlers have succeeded to translate the text from Javanese language, their mother tongue, into English. However, there are still some grammatical mistakes, especially the wrong use of tenses that can be found in this film subtitling project.

3.1.4. Resignation Strategy

Resignation strategy is the strategy adopted when no translation solution can be found and meaning is inevitably lost.

(1a) "Belajar yang rajin, ya?"
(1b) "Study diligently, will you?"
(2a) "Nah, itu yang namanya gunung lawu Amel, ..."
(2b) "Really? That's Mt. Lawu."
(3a) "Eyang marahan ya sama mamah?"
(3b) "Are you two fighting?"
(4a) "Takutnya malah kalo bikin dia sakit Mas!"
(4b) "I'm afraid we'll only make her worried"

(5a) "Itu suara apa Mbah?"

(5b) "What is that sound?"

The tag question 'will you' in extract 1b sounds awkward in a spoken language. It would be more natural to use 'ok' instead of 'will you'. While the interjection '*nah*' in extract 2a is not equivalent to 'really' in English. Using 'well' or 'now' would be more appropriate instead. The speaker of the sentence in extract 3a, Amelia, was talking to her grandparents about her mother when she expressed this utterance. The utterance in 3b implied that the two persons who fighting are both grandparents. Thus, to avoid misunderstanding, it is better to translate all parts of the sentence become "Are you two fighting with my mom?" The word 'worried' in 4b has a different meaning with '*sakit*' in Indonesian language. '*Sakit*' is better translated into 'getting sick' in English. Extract 5a would be better translated into English become "what sound is that?" instead of "what is that sound?". The speaker actually wanted to know about the kind or source of sound he heard at the time of speaking instead of the definition or meaning of the sound.

3.1.5. Paraphrase Strategy

This strategy is used in the case where the phraseology of the original cannot be reconstructed in the same syntactic way in the target language.

(1a) "Mau"

(1b) "I want one!"

(2a) "Dari tadi aku kan udah ngaku salah ..."

(2b) "I know it was my fault ..."

(3a) "Mbah tidak akan pernah pergi-pergi"

(3b) "I'll never go anywhere"

(4a) "Hah! Nelpon terus! Nelpon terus! Bikin repot aja."

(4b) "Stop calling me! I'm busy here!"

Student subtitlers decided to render some utterances in the film by paraphrasing them into more natural expression. As an example, "I want one!" is used to translate the Indonesian utterance '*mau*'. It makes the English translation sounds very natural in the target language. Indonesian expression "Dari tadi aku kan udah ngaku salah..." was also translated naturally into English become "I know it was my fault". Other examples are "Mbah tidak akan pernah pergi-pergi" becomes "I'll never go anywhere". and "Hah! Nelpon terus! Nelpon terus! Bikin repot aja" become "Stop calling me! I'm busy here!". The addressing term '*Mbah*' is used by the speaker to address himself has been translated into subject pronoun 'I' in English that sounds very natural for English speakers. While the use of object pronoun 'me' and subject pronoun 'I' are used in "Stop calling me! I'm busy here!" although the Indonesian utterance does not use both pronouns explicitly.

3.1.6. Deletion Strategy

Deletion strategy is the total elimination of parts of a text.

(1a) "cie-ciieeeeh"

(1b) [CATCALLS]

(2a) "Emangnya"

(2b) ....

(3a) "Toloooooong"

(3b) ....
(4a) "asalamualaikum"
(4b) [SAYING PRAYER]
(5a) "ayo! balik! balik! balik!"
(5b) ...

Some parts of the text are deleted by student subtitlers might be because the expressions are too short. For examples, "emangnya" dan "tolooooong" were deleted by students in their subtitling project. While the interjection "cie-ciieeeeh" does not translate but is replaced with a description note in brackets '[CATCALLS]' and "asalamualaikum" with '[SAYING PRAYER]'. The expression "ayo! balik! balik! balik!" is deleted all at once although the expression is longer because of the repetition.

3.1.7. Imitation Strategy

This strategy is applied by the student subtitlers especially for the names of people, profession, and place that are familiar in the source language. Some of them are:

(1a) "Ada <u>Mbah gondrong</u>."
(1b) "<u>Mbah gondrong</u> is here."
(2a) "Pak, <u>genderuwo</u> keluar lagi dari sarangnya Pak."
(2b) "Sir ... <u>the genderuwo</u> is out of its hiding."
(3a) "Pandu, anak-anak tadi bercerita, kalau kamu mencelakai cucu <u>pak lurah</u>, benar begitu?"
(3b) "Pandu, your friends told me that you hurt <u>pak lurah</u>'s grandchildren."
(4a) "Nah, itu yang namanya <u>gunung lawu</u> Amel,..."
(4b) "That's <u>Mt. Lawu</u>..."

Mbah gondrong and genderuwo in this film are used by the speaker to refer to a man they do not really know but is identified as a forest spirit who protect the forest. Instead of finding the near equivalent in the target language, such as ghost, student subtitlers choose to imitate the names in their subtitle. Pak lurah is the title for a man who head the village, but students subtitlers prefer to maintain the addressing terms regardless of target language viewers' understanding. Similar to other proper names in the film, the imitation of gunung Lawu becomes Mt. Lawu in the target text should be understood well by the target language viewers.

3.1.8. Decimation Strategy

Decimation strategy is an extreme form of condensation where perhaps for reasons of discourse speed, even potentially important elements are omitted.

(1a) "Mama sudah nelfon supir mobil jemputan kalo pagi ini kamu ikut Mama."
(1b) "I've told the your pick-up that you'll go with me."
(2a) "Kok bisa-bisanya suamimu percaya dengan penipu kayak gitu."
(2b) "How could your husband trust that person?"
(3a) "Cucu saya yang namanya Amelia itu justru baru saya kenal sekarang."
(3b) "We've just recently met Amelia."
(4a) "Kita sekarang kembali ke tempat semula."
(4b) "We need to go back."

The utterance in 1b does not mention and translate two important elements in 1a, i.e. '*supir*' (driver) and '*pagi ini*' (this morning) as the exact time of speaking.

Similarly, the word '*penipu'* (deceiver) in 2a is omitted in its English subtitling. In 3a the family relationship mentioned by the speaker (grandfather) is omitted also in 3b that makes the information is not complete. The adverb of place "ke tempat semula" in 4a is not mentioned in 4b. In general, it seems that student subtitlers omit some information from the source text for the sake of simplicity by considering the limited space to write as well as to read the subtitle.

3.1.9. Dislocation Strategy

This strategy is adopted when the original employs some sort of special effects, e.g. a silly song in a cartoon film where the translation of the effect is more important than the content.

(1a) "Oh, ada-ada, ada!"
(1b) "Owh, wait, we got it."
(2a) "Eh, bentar-bentar."
(2b) "Eh, wait a minute."

According to Longman Contemporary English Dictionary 'oh' is used to make a slight pause, especially before replying to a question or giving your opinion on something. It means that the use of 'owh' that is considered as the equivalence of '*oh*' from Indonesian interjection is not suitable in this context. In a similar way, English does not have the interjection '*eh*' that is very familiar in Indonesian. Thus, if the use of "oh" and "eh" is because of the special effects getting from their pronunciation, it can cause the target audience to misinterpreted these expressions.

3.1.10. Expansion Strategy

Expansion strategy is used when the original text requires an explanation because of some cultural nuance not retrievable in the target language.

(1a) "Mau!"
(1b) "I want one."
(2a) "Saya akan putarkan lagu yang cocok untuk menghangatkan malam Anda."
(2b) "In the meantime, here's a song to warm your night."
(3a) "...."
(3b) "Great thinking, sir!"

This expansion strategy is used by student subtitler to convey the information completely to the target audience and to produce a natural sound of the translation in the target language. As an example, the utterance "mau!" as the passionate expression of likeness is not translated word for word become 'want', but it is translated into "I want one" that is more natural and formal in English.

Other linguistic problems found in the students' subtitling are mostly related with sentence structure, such as incomplete sentences, inappropriate sentences, wrong choice of words/dictions/expressions/interjections, wrong tenses, singular-plural nouns/pronouns, article, preposition, mechanics, mistyping, etc.

a) Incomplete sentences

An example of an incomplete sentence mentioned in strategy 10 above i.e. resignation is "Are you two fighting?". Actually, the speaker of this utterance addresses the question to her both grandparents about their relation with her mother. In order to avoid misunderstanding, it's better to use more complete sentence becomes

"Are you (two) fighting with my mom?" Without the additional prepositional phrase 'with my mom', the target audience of the film may perceive that two people who fighting are both grandparents. Even though audience may understand the whole message from the context, it's better to provide them with an unambiguous statement.

b) *Inappropriate sentences*

"I don't think that you can do it mas". The statement sounds so unnatural in the target language. So it will be more natural if it changes into "I think you can't" or "I don't think so" without mentioning the Javanese addressing term '*mas*' at the end of the sentence as in its source text that is culturally acceptable in source language.

"... don't you ever go into that forest" also sounds so unnatural due to the use of "don't you ever" instead of "never". Generally, "don't" is used by Indonesian people to stop one condition of something or to instruct others not to do something/ action in English. Student subtitlers fail to consider the word 'ever' that follows the subject to form "don't ... ever" become "never" that is more natural in English.

c) *Wrong tenses*

The inappropriate use of tenses still appears several times in this students' subtitling project. For example, in both "... could've listened to her" and "Have you change your mobile with ...?" utterances, student subtitlers fail to use the present perfect tense by using the verb 'listen' and 'change' instead of 'listened' and 'changed'. Other examples can also be identified in these utterances, i.e. "I forget that ..." and "She never goes anywhere".

Subject 'I' that should be followed by a bare infinitive 'forget' and pronoun 'she' that should be followed by infinitive + es 'goes' in the simple present tense have been exchanged by student subtitlers in those two sentences. In other words, student subtitlers still fail to apply suitable subject-verb agreement in the simple present tense.

In "Where did those kids run off to?", student subtitlers have identified the utterance as the question in the simple past tense, but both the verb and auxiliary are in the past form. This redundancy has made the sentence grammatically incorrect.

d) *Wrong word order, choice of words/interjections*

To be 'is' in "He's out?" should be followed by subject 'he' as an interrogative sentence, but the students write them in the wrong order.
"... here somewhere" should also be written in reverse become "somewhere here".

"The money's for paying the mortgage, Ma'am". Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English (LDOCE) differs the meaning of mortgage and rent. Based on LDOCE definition, the word 'mortgage' in this context is not suitable because it refers to a legal arrangement by which you borrow money from a bank or similar organization in order to buy a house, and pay back the money over a period of years. To be exact, it is acceptable to apply the term 'rent' as the money that someone pays for the use of a room, a house, etc that belongs to someone else. Thus, 'rent' is more appropriate than a mortgage in this context.

There are some misuses of interjections found in the students' English subtitle. One of them is the use of 'owh' which cannot be found in LDOCE but 'ow' that basically used to express sudden pain. Student subtitlers used 'owh' in the expression like, "Owh, that's right!" and "Owh, wait, we got it". The expression "Owh, it's done"

is the English translation of "ooo, sudah oke." 'Ooo' in this Indonesian context is used just to emphasize that everything is ok. Based on the context of this utterance, 'owh' in this expression is better replaced by 'well'. While, the expression "Owh, that's right!" is students' translation of "oh ya" from the source text. In Indonesian context, 'oh' here is used as a sign that something is true or the speaker agrees with something. Thus, to be exact it is better to use 'yeah' or 'yes'. "Owh, wait, we got it" comes from Indonesian text "Oh, ada, ada, ada!". It is better to use 'oh' instead of 'owh' in its English translation as a sign that the interjection is used to make a slight pause before replying to a question.

Another interjection that is very familiar in the source language is 'eh' that can also be found in the source text. In translating "eh, bentar, bentar," students still use the same interjection in the source text. As a matter of fact, it is equivalent with English interjection 'hey' that according to LDOCE is "a shout used to get someone's attention or to express surprise, interest, or annoyance."

e) *Singular-Plural nouns/pronouns*

Student subtitlers do not always succeed to apply right pronouns in their project. As an example, in translating "Mbah Gondrong? Siapa" into English, students use 'it' as the pronoun of Mbah Gondrong becomes "Mbah Gondrong? Who is it?". Similarly, 'kamu' has been translated by students becomes 'we'. It can be found in the translation of utterance 'Kalau kamu sedih kita nggak bisa mikir' becomes "If we're sad, we won't be able to think." Both 'kamu' and 'kita' in the utterance have been translated into English becomes 'we' by students. It might be happened because of their carelessness in interpreting the target text.

In relation to singular and plural noun agreement, it is found that student subtitlers still fail to use the right form in some cases. As an example is the use of plural noun after the article 'a' in "a two-days workshop". Other examples are the determiner 'each' and 'one' that has been followed by plural instead of singular nouns in the utterance like "Have you known each other?" and "One thing is sure ...". The use of to be 'is' as the predicate of complement so many butterflies in "... and there are so many butterflies" is grammatically inappropriate as well.

f) *Article/determiner*

Article 'an' should be followed by a noun with initial vocal sound (phoneme a, i, u, e, o) but students have done the wrong choice of article in "... who has a naughty child like you." Article 'a' that is suitable for determiner of singular or uncountable of noun has been wrong applied in "... there are a lot of stars in here". Thus, determiner 'a lot of' should be replaced with 'lots of' because it is used with plural noun 'stars'.

g) *Preposition*

The inappropriate uses of preposition 'of' are identified in some parts, such as in "That's because she never visited us" and "she never agreed of me going here". In the first utterance, preposition 'of' should be omitted for preposition 'of' or conjunction 'because of' should be followed by noun or gerund, not pronoun. It is similar to the use of 'of' in the second utterance, although it seems better to change the sentence into more natural way by "she never permitted me to come here". Whereas, in the utterance "take care Amelia", the preposition 'of' is needed actually to make it more acceptable

in the target language becomes "take care of Amelia" but students missed it. The use of preposition 'in' in "... or lost in the mountain" is better replaced by 'on'. Similarly, the use of 'at' in "No, Ma'am. They met at FB" is not suitable also and it is better to use 'on' in this context.

h) *Mechanics*

Some inappropriate uses of mechanics also can be identified in the target text. The addressing term in direct speech and proper name should be capitalized, but students do not always succeed to apply this basic rule in writing. Two examples of them are found in the utterances "It's so lovely, dad" and "... you better with ambar near the house". The initial letter of 'dad' that is used toward a person in a conversation in the first sentence and 'ambar' as the proper name shouldn't be written in small letter but students did it.

i) *Mistyping*

Mistyping happens either in the form of repetition, misspelling, or division between lines. The repetition can be found in "Until he he finally met your mother" in which pronoun 'he' is typed twice. There are too many misspellings in the students' subtitling, such as 'correct' instead of 'correct', 'to' instead of 'too', 'fell' instead of 'feel', 'ringing' instead of 'ringing', and 'kidnapped' instead of 'kidnapped'. It is important to pay attention to the division between lines in typing to avoid misinterpretation of the message and to help target audience comprehend the message easily. As a matter of fact, students still struggle to be skillful in typing.

3.2. Technical Aspect

In technical aspect or competence, Jan-Louis Kruger in Cintas (2008:86) proposes three main things that should be taken into account in assessing the technical skills in subtitles. They are: 1) Cueing of duration, 2) Cueing of rhythm, and 3) Division of subtitles.

3.2.1. *Cueing of Duration*

It deals with the sufficient length and time of subtitle. The subtitler should consider both the maximum and the minimum length of one-line and two-lines subtitles to make it not too long or too short. The subtitler also should give sufficient time for the audience to read the subtitle and to take in the image.

It seems that student subtitlers are still difficult to shorten their translation in a more effective way. It might be because they are too faithful with the source text, so they tend to translate all elements in the source text. Due to that phenomenon, most of the students' subtitles in this movie are rather long and need more time to read them all. It can be seen from several parts of their subtitling projects.

The data show that ineffective organization of language cause the subtitles tend to be longer. As an example, instead of using expression in A, it is better to use B in the following table.

A	B
I'm going to go to Paris to see my Grandma because I miss her a lot.	I'm going to see my Grandma in Paris I miss her a lot.

...while being the head of the family who has a naughty child like you.	... being the head of the family with a naughty child like you
Mel, seriously, don't you ever go into that forest.	Mel, please never go into that forest.

3.2.2. Cueing of Rhythm

It relates to visual rhythm and sound rhythm of film as well as the film boundaries. The subtitler should take into account whether the subtitles are on or off too early or too late.

There are still some parts where the subtitles appear too long on the screen that cause the next subtitle are being late to appear. While Haikuo (2013) said that the duration of the subtitles should not be too short or too long on the screen for the convenience of the viewers. This study also shows that some soundtracks of the movie are not translated by student. Thus, for several minutes, the subtitles do not appear and the audience lost access to the translation of the songs. From 00:22:00 – 00:23:12, the movie plays two songs as the soundtrack of the movie, but students do not translate and make the subtitle of those two songs. It also happens from 00:25:49 – 00:26:00 in which the movie play "Anak Gembala" song and from 00:32:45 – 00:35:00 while the movie playing two children songs "Kupandang Langit Penuh Bintang" and "Amelia". The typical characteristic of song that leads to the difficulties in its translation might be the main reason why students do not translate all the Indonesian songs in the movie and leave the subtitles off for more than one minute.

3.2.3. Division of subtitles

A good subtitle should have a good division of subtitles. Subtitler does not only consider the exact division of line-to-line but also subtitle-to-subtitle.

Number	A	B
1	Bambang, dad's brother, Mom. <u>Don't you</u> know him? Or have you forgotten?!	Bambang, dad's brother, Mom. Don't you know him? Or have you forgotten?!
2	Ambar's father. <u>Didn't</u> I tell you?	Ambar's father. Didn't I tell you?
3	If we're lost during daylight, <u>how</u> can we find the way in the dark?	If we're lost during daylight, How can we find the way in the dark?
4	Just admit that you're wrong. <u>This</u> has nothing to do with <i>Shalat</i>.	Just admit that you're wrong. This has nothing to do with <i>Shalat</i>.
5	I miss my mom too. <u>We haven't</u> talked for two days...	I miss my mom too. We haven't talked for two days...
6	And we can't think, <u>we</u> won't find our way out.	And we can't think, We won't find our way out.
7	Once, I used to leave <u>the</u> people who loved me.	Once, I used to leave The people who loved me.

The division of subtitle should take into account both linguistic and technical aspects, e.g. the length of utterance (the number of words per line), the aesthetic aspect, the line breaks according to sense blocks either at sentence, clause, phrase, or word level.

The data in the table above show how students still face some difficulties in making a good division of lines. Three sentences in number 1 would look better if the second and third sentences are put at the lower line. The separation of subject and its auxiliary verbs with other elements in the second sentence may disturb the audience's focus and comprehension. Moreover, the upper line should be shorter than the lower level that aesthetically would also look better. To simplify, the three sentences could be separated into two subtitles. Like subtitling number 1, the division of lines in subtitling 2, 4, 5, and 6 separate the subject and/or auxiliary verbs from its other components of sentence. Subtitle number 3 makes a division between the question word and the rest of the interrogative sentence. In subtitle number 7, the division takes place at the noun and its article 'the'. Thus, student subtitlers sometimes fail to make a proper division of subtitles and lines in separating one sentence into different lines although the space in one line is still sufficient for the complete sentence.

4. Discussion

The past decade has seen as a renewed importance in introducing and offering Audiovisual Translation (AVT) especially subtitling at the university especially by Cintas (2001) due to its entertaining and innovative aspects that will encourage students to enjoy the subject, i.e. foreign language. Many studies have proved the positive effects of subtitle on students. In their studies on subtitling strategies used in the Iranian feature films, Marashi & Poursoltani (2009) have found that the use of AVT especially subtitling is essential in language learning to increase listening and spelling skills, vocabulary building, pronunciation, and reading and writing skills in terms of summarizing, rephrasing, and paraphrasing. Similarly, Neves (in Orero, 2004) suggested that subtitles may improve students' linguistic competence and technical know-how in a more enjoyable atmosphere. In their study about language learning higher education, Buffagni, et al. (2017) also revealed that subtitling is an effective resource to boost foreign language skills in spontaneous & guided contexts and to improve students' critical abilities. The possibility to not only improve translation skills but also to develop student subtitlers' critical thinking by means of the subtitle is also stated by McLoughlin (2009). Even, Kristijan Nikolić (2011) pointed out that the major role of subtitling is not only "as a means of improving foreign language skills but also as a means of improving cultural literacy". In addition to those advantages of offering subtitle at university, Kapsaskis (2011) suggested that there should be a specialized translator training with a holistic approach in a globalized context because it will affect the status of professional translators.

In this subtitling class, students were assigned to translate/subtitle from English into Indonesian as well as from Indonesian into English as a foreign language. Translating into a foreign language has a skopos to introduce Indonesian language and culture to global society all over the world. Liangqiu Lv, et al. (2014) has proved in her study that the practice of skopos theory in translating TV series to Chinese

viewers is effective. Hopefully, this project will be effective to meet the skopos of this practice.

Christopher Rundle (in McLoughlin, 2009) felt that students who are taught to subtitle into foreign language should not be demanded to give much attention on the correctness of their works but they should be encouraged to learn to evaluate the strategies they choose. Nevertheless, students should be introduced with the quality standard required to fulfill by every subtitler that is called by Gambier (in Bartrina, 2009) as "accessibility" that consists of acceptability, legibility, readability, synchronicity, relevance and translation strategies. Limited scope of a study done by Orrego-Carmona, et al. (2018) has shown that subtitling tool, age and experience influence both professional and trainee subtitlers in the subtitling process. However, the study conducted by Orrego-Carmona (2015) affirmed that there is no significant difference in viewers' quality assessment on the translation made by non-professional and professional subtitlers. It is definitely influenced by the good level of viewers' proficiency in the Source Language of the subtitled contents/products.

There are some common problems faced by students in doing their subtitling projects related to linguistic and/or technical aspects. According to Diaz (2004), the study on AVT especially subtitling at the time still emphasized on the linguistics aspect and paid less attention to the technical aspect which also plays an important role in subtitling or AVT. In the translation/subtitling of *Harry Potter* film from English into Arabic for children, Altahri has found that the subtitlers experienced a complex cultural, ideological, and technical problems (Altahri, 2013). The analysis of problems and strategies in translating emotion has been done by Suzanne (2016) and verbally expressed humor by Garcia-Escribano (2017). For students subtitlers who are the subject of this research, translating cultural terms and some expressions like interjection or exclamation is also problematic.

Based on her study, Suzanne (2016) suggested that in order to improve target language of the viewers' understanding of emotions in the film, the subtitler used modulation and adaptation strategies. Whereas, in his study on subtitling audiovisual humor, Garcia-Escribano (2017) stated that the strategy used in translating Verbally Expressed Humour (VEH) depends on the context and image of the film and approach. While Marashi & Poursoltani (2009) in their study about subtitling strategies used in the Iranian feature films, revealed that the most frequent strategy used by the subtitler is transfer and the least frequent strategy is deletion. Caimi (in Diaz, 2009) was more interested to focus her study on linguistics aspect of AVT, particularly the practice of simplification strategy in subtitling. In her preliminary study on students' subtitling on the soundtrack of "Ambilkan Bulan" movie, Kendenan (in Wachidah et al., 2014) found that the student subtitlers tend to be faithful to the source text by applying phonemic and metrical translation strategies from Lefevere (in Bassnett, 1991) by preserving the number of syllables of the song lyrics. However, by applying Gottlieb's ten strategies for the film subtitle in general student subtitlers are frequently use transcription strategy. Thus, it can be said that the choice of strategy in subtitling depends on the types or genres of the text and the underlying theory applied in the study.

Two technical aspects that sometimes arises problems are time and space limitations. The problem was experienced by the student subtitlers in several parts of

their subtitles. Haikuo (2013) said that "Subtitles must meet the requirement of space and speech duration... Therefore, in subtitling, the original message often needs to be simplified, which is another general technique of subtitling. The most common strategies used to simplify lines are condensation, reductive paraphrasing, and omission."

5. Conclusion

This study shows that making an English subtitle for an Indonesian movie has some typical challenges. One of them is the cultural differences between the source language and target language as well between the viewers of source text and the target text. From ten strategies proposed by Gottlieb, transcription strategy, has the highest frequency in use. It is consecutively followed by strategy of condensation, transfer, resignation, paraphrase, deletion, imitation, decimation, dislocation, and expansion. Students do not only struggle to choose the right strategy in finding the equivalent at word and above word level but also with some linguistic and technical aspects in making the English subtitle.

Some problems in linguistic aspect are related with incomplete and inappropriate sentences, wrong tenses, wrong choice of words or interjections, subject-verb agreement, singular-plural noun agreement, inappropriate use of article or determiner, preposition, mechanics, and mistyping. On technical aspects, students still do not always succeed to deal with cueing duration and rhythm, segmentation or division of dialogue and lines in the subtitle.

Hopefully, this study will give new insight for lecturers to give more attention to the most potential errors that students may encounter in doing the subtitling project. Based on the finding, every lecture is suggested to create their own strategies in teaching film subtitling especially from mother tongue to English by considering the cultural differences between those two languages as well as some other linguistic and technical aspects.

References

Altahri, A. (2013) 'Issues and Strategies of Subtitling Cultural References Harry Potter Movies in Arabic'. Salford, UK: University of Salford.

Bartrina, F. (2009) 'Teaching subtitling in a virtual environment', in *Audiovisual Translation*. Hampshire: Springer, pp. 229–239.

Baker, Mona. (Ed.). 2001. Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies. London and New York: Routledge.

Buffagni, C., Garzelli, B., & Ghia, E. (2017). La Vita È Bella (Benigni 1997) and Its Subtitled Versions in the Teaching of L2 English, Spanish, and German. In Liliana Szczuka-Dorna & Breffni O'rourke (Eds.), *Language Learning in Higher Education: Journal of The European Confederation of Language Centres in Higher Education (Circles)*, 7(2): 311–332. Altahri, A. (2013) 'Issues and Strategies of Subtitling Cultural References Harry Potter Movies in Arabic'. Salford, UK: University of Salford.

Bartrina, F. (2009) 'Teaching subtitling in a virtual environment', in *Audiovisual Translation*. Hampshire: Springer, pp. 229–239.

Baker, Mona. (Ed.). 2001. Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies. London and New York: Routledge.

Buffagni, C., Garzelli, B., & Ghia, E. (2017). La Vita È Bella (Benigni 1997) and Its Subtitled Versions in the Teaching of L2 English, Spanish, and German. In Liliana Szczuka-Dorna & Breffni O'rourke (Eds.), *Language Learning in Higher Education: Journal Of The European Confederation Of Language Centres In Higher Education (Circles)*, 7(2): 311–332. https://doi.org/10.1515/cercles-2017-0012

Caimi, Annamaria. (2009). Subtitling: Language Learners'Needs vs. Audiovisual Market Needs. In Jorge Diaz Cintas & Gunilla Anderman (Eds.). *Audiovisual Translation: Language Transfer on Screen* (pp. 240-251). Palgrave Macmillan, Hampshire, UK.

Cintas, Jorge Diaz. (2001). Teaching Subtitling at University. The Educational Resources Information Center (Eric). Roehampton University of Surrey.

Cintas, Jorge Díaz. (2004). Subtitling: The Long Journey to Academic Acknowledgement. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, Issue 1 January 2004. University of Surrey Roehampton, London.

Cintas, Jorge Diaz. (Ed.). (2008). The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation. Amsterdam/ Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

García-Escribano, Alejandro Bolaños. (2017). Subtitling Audiovisual Humour: The Case Of 'Early Almodóvar' Films During *La Movida* In Spain (1980-1984). *Monti* 9 (2017: 219-247). ISSN 1889-4178. DOI: 10.6035/Monti.2017.9.8 (pp. 219-247).

Ghaemi, Farid & Janin Benyamin. (2010). *Strategies Used in the Translation of Interlingual Subtitling*. Journal of English Studies: Islamic Azad University, Science & Research Branch (pp. 39-49).

Gottlieb, Henrik. (2004). Language-Political Implications of Subtitling. In Pilar Orero (Ed.). *Topics in Audiovisual Translation*. (pp. 83-100). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Haikuo, Yu. (2013). English-Chinese Film Translation in China. *Journal of Translation*. Volume 9, Number 2 (pp. 55-65).

Ivarsson (2013). http://www.transedit.se/code.htm, last accessed March 29, 2013, at 12.10.

Janecová, Emilia. (2012). "Teaching Audiovisual Translation: Theory and Practice in the Twenty-first Century". *Çankaya University Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 9/1* (May 2012), pp.17–29. © Çankaya Üniversitesi ISSN 1309-6761 Printed in Turkey.

Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia. (2008). Edisi Keempat.

Kapsaskis, Dionysios. (2011). Professional identity and training of translators in the context of globalization: The example of subtitling. *The Journal of Specialised Translation,* Issue 16 – July 2011. (pp 162-184). Roehampton University, London, UK.

Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English. Third Edition. (2001). Harlow: Pearson Education Limited.

Lv, L., Zhu, H., & Ning, P. (2014). Subtitle Translation of Foreign Movies and TV Series under Skopos Theory. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, Vol. 5, No. 4, pp. 901-905, July 2014. Finland: Academy Publisher.

Marashi, Hamid & Poursoltani, Khatereh. (2009). An Analysis of Farsi into English Subtitling Strategies Employed in Iranian Feature Films. *Journal of Teaching English as a Foreign Language and Literature,* 1 (1), pp. 15-29.

McLoughlin, Laura Incalcaterra. (2009). Subtitles in Translators' Training: A Model of Analysis. *Romance Studies*, Vol. 27 No. 3, July 2009, 174–185. DOI: 10.1179/174581509X455141

Neves, Josélia. (2004). Language awareness through training in subtitling. In Pilar Orero (ed.), *Topics in Audiovisual Translation*. (pp 127-140). Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing.

Nikolić, Kristijan. (2011). The Perception of Culture through Subtitles: An Empirical Study as Seen in TV Material in Croatia. *Dissertation*.

Orrego-Carmona, David. (2015). The Reception of (Non)Professional Subtitling. *Doctoral Thesis*. Department of English and German Studies. Universitat Rovira I Virgili, Tarragona.

Orrego-Carmona, D., Dutka, Ł., & Szarkowska, A. (2018). Using Translation Process Research to Explore the Creation of Subtitles: An Eye-Tracking Study Comparing Professional and Trainee Subtitlers. *The Journal of Specialised Translation,* Issue 30 – July 2018 (pp. 150-180).

Stevens, Alan M & A. Ed. Schmidgall-Tellings. (2014). Kamus Lengkap Indonesia-Inggris: A Comprehensive Indonesian-English Dictionary. Second edition. Bandung: PT Mizan Pustaka.

Suzanne, A. (2016). Translation of Emotions in Subtitling of the Film *Paris à tout Prix*. *International Journal of English Language & Translation Studies. 4(2), 177-191.* Retrieved From http://www.eltsjournal.org

Wachidah, S., Rochsantiningsih, D., Yuliasri, I., Al-Zubaidi, K.O., & Anugerahwati, M. (Eds.). (2014). Conference Proceeding from *3rd English Language Teaching, Literature, and Translation International Conference*. (pp. 297-308). Semarang: Faculty of Language & Arts, Semarang State University.