



## Translating Discriminatory Expressions in Pramoedya Ananta Toer's Outstanding Novel

Nunun Tri Widarwati\*, Bayu H Wicaksono<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>University of Veteran Bangun Nusantara Sukoharjo, Jawa Tengah, Indonesia. E-mail: [nunun6323@gmail.com](mailto:nunun6323@gmail.com)

<sup>2</sup>Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Jawa Timur, Indonesia. E-mail: [bayu\\_hw@umm.ac.id](mailto:bayu_hw@umm.ac.id)

\*Corresponding author

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Keywords:

Discrimination; Indonesia; Literary work; Social class; Translation

#### How to cite:

Widarwati, N.T., Wicaksono, B.H. (2022). Translating Discriminatory Expressions in Pramoedya Ananta Toer's Outstanding Novel. *Langkawi: Journal of The Association for Arabic and English*, 8(1), 15-31.

#### DOI:

<http://dx.doi.org/10.31332/lkw.v0i0.3811>

#### History:

Submitted: 2022-03-27

Revised: 2022-05-29; 2022-06-03

Accepted: 2022-06-09

Published: 2022-06-20

### ABSTRACT

Although studies on the expression of social class discrimination in the novel have much been documented, there is a paucity of research addressing how the expression of social class discrimination is translated into English. In response to this void, the present study aims at examining translation techniques in the expressions of social class discrimination in the novels written by Pramoedya Ananta Tour. This research employed a translation case study research design. The data were collected through observations and Focus Group Discussion. The data originated from Pramoedya Ananta Toer's novel, containing clauses containing social class discrimination. In this study, two questions were posed. First, what expressions of social class discrimination were found in the novel? Second, how was the expression containing social class discrimination translated into English? The findings showcase that the expressions of social class discrimination encompass subordination, stereotypical perspective, marginalization, and violence. In the same way, the most dominant translation technique is established equivalence, followed by modulation, explicitation, implicitation, paraphrase, transposition, pure borrowing, addition, reduction, generalization, discursive creation, particularization, description, variant borrowing, and deletion. The use of those translation techniques indicates that the quality of the translation is considered good. Discussion of implications empirically and practically is presented in the last part of this article.

## 1. Introduction

Social scientists have conducted extensive studies to identify which segment of society reports discriminative behaviors based on group identities, such as race, social class, and gender (Fiske, 1998). Layton and Smith (2017) reported that one-third of participants in Brazil experience race, social class, and gender discrimination. However, class-based social discrimination is more dominantly felt than race- and gender-based discrimination. Social class discrimination happens because of skin color problems instead of household wealth, education, and the area of residence ones. Colak, Van Praag & Nicaies's (2020) research revealed that university students of Turkish descent experience various forms of educational discrimination in Flanders, Northern Belgium. It happens since they are considered an 'immigrant community' instead of 'indigenous people' due to inheritance, religious and ethnic reasons. Ethnic and cultural differences are very important social variables in public and political discourses in Belgium. Although socially unacceptable, waves of immigration from Eastern Europe, Turkey, and sub-Saharan Africa to Western Europe have further

triggered racism, xenophobia, and Islamophobia since they are viewed as immortal strangers with different cultures (Billiet, Jaspert, and Swyngedouw, 2012). In Jamaica, a middle-income country dominated by black skin, the problem tends to be in the form of racial discrimination. Racial discrimination is regarded as equally important as class discrimination in the country. The name given to a certain race may also represent one's socioeconomic status. Job providers prefer applicants who are considered to come from high-income backgrounds. Although qualification is unimportant, people with names preferred by job providers have lower chances of being employed if they possess high-quality resumes (Greenland et al., 2020; Spencer, Urquhart & Whitely, 2020).

The research showed that discrimination problems are always related to ethnic, social class, race, gender, religion, age, and income issues. In Indonesia, social class discrimination also occurred, especially during Dutch colonialism. Javanese women acted as servants whose employers were the Dutch Company. It means that Javanese women were in the lower social class position while the employers were in the higher class. Even Javanese women worked as laborers and subordinates who were often ordered to do anything. It has inspired many writers and scholars to write and pour it into works, including a well-known scholar in Indonesia, Pramoedya Ananta Toer. Pramoedya Ananta Toer has written many novels about struggling against social class discrimination. This kind of theme makes Pramoedya's novels quite difficult when they are translated into target languages. The translators must relay ideological ideas of struggle against social class discrimination into the translated text. The translators should conduct it, remembering existing differences in languages, norms, and cultures between the source and the target languages. The translators are challenged to raise the social class and gender issues in the Javanese society and cultures in English well so that the target readers can accept the conveyance.

Up to now, much research on social class discrimination in literary works has been documented. However, research on social class discrimination in literary works in Indonesia from the translation perspective is still rarely conducted. Therefore, this present research aims to reveal the social class discrimination expressions occurring in novels written by Pramoedya Ananta Toer. Two questions are raised in this research: what form of the social class discrimination expressions exists in Indonesian literary works, and how the social class discrimination expressions in the novels are translated into English as the target language. This research argues that discrimination cannot be avoided since it is a part of innate human desires and passions. Some members of society think that they are better than others. It is this aspect that triggers discrimination throughout human life. Zionist Jewish community groups pride themselves as humans chosen by God, and as a result, they adhere to a philosophy of racist supremacy (ethnic, racial superiority/conceit). In America, white supremacy and conceit are principles for American citizens. Because of the basic principle, the white people will always underestimate the black skin people who live with them.

## **2. Literature Review**

### **2.1. Social class discrimination**

Social class refers to the dimension of the self-based on material sources, such as incomes, education, jobs, and subjective class perception of others (Kahtleen, 2017). In contrast, the concept of discrimination points to human attitudes toward other

humans. Such discrimination emerges due to incorrect perceptions of differences existing in society. The differences may be either naturally or socially constructed. Theodorson & Theodorson (1979) expressed that discrimination is the imbalanced treatment of someone or a society based on specific attributes, such as races, ethnic groups, religions, or certain social classes or strata. The imbalanced or unfair treatment does not come naturally, but it is based on incorrect perceptions of someone or groups of people from different backgrounds. Therefore, it can be stated that social class discrimination refers to imbalanced behaviors of someone or a group of people because of social labels attached to them. The attached social label may be either naturally or socially constructed.

Handayani (2006) classified social class discrimination into some forms: marginalization, subordination, stereotype, violence, and workload. Marginalization is a process of putting aside certain social groups in terms of either gender or social class from the public. This marginalization causes a social group not to have any chance to be involved in various aspects of life. This marginalization may mean repelling one from one's residence or job in certain cases. Subordination points to an attitude or a view that considers a certain social group to possess a higher degree than others. This assumption or view may affect various things in people's life. An assumption that a social group is lower than the others result in different opportunities among these social groups in various social events. Stereotype refers to negative marking or labeling of certain social groups that may harm the groups. This labeling implies the social roles of a certain social group. Violence points to the realization of social discrimination, not only physical such as beatings, harassment, torture, or other physical attacks. It may also be psychological, even economic. One of the manifestations of social class discrimination is the distinction of workload among certain social groups in society. Social groups considered higher will get a lighter workload, while those regarded lower will obtain a much higher workload. This workload difference is inversely proportional to revenue generation. Lower social groups with heavy workloads earn relatively low incomes, whereas higher social groups with fewer workloads get relatively higher incomes than those of lower social groups. It certainly causes injustice in workload.

## **2.2. Translation technique**

Nida and Taber (1982) stated that translation refers to the reproduction of a message from the source language into the target language with the closest and natural equivalent of the form. To reach the equivalent form and meaning, translation techniques are needed. Molina and Albir (2002) proposed that a translation technique is a procedure to analyze and classify how translation equivalence proceeds and may be applied in various lingual units at word, phrase, clause, and sentence levels. They proposed 18 translation techniques, namely (1) adaptation, replacement of cultural elements in the source language in the cultural elements in the target language, (2) amplification is an umbrella term for some translation techniques. They are addition, description, explicitation, annotation, and paraphrase. Addition is a translation technique giving additional explanation to a foreign term. Description is a translation technique that explains a term in detail. The difference with addition is that the foreign term is not maintained in the description. Instead, the term is directly replaced with a detailed explanation. Explicitation is a translation technique that expresses implied

messages of a word, a phrase, or a clause. Paraphrasing is a translation technique that conveys messages from a text in the source language into the one in the target language in different ways. Meanwhile, annotation is a translation technique that describes a term usually put in the footnote in which the foreign term is found.

Established equivalence is a translation technique that looks for a common equivalent in the target language appropriate to the context of the situation and culture of a text. The opposite of established equivalence is discursive creation. It is a translation technique that tries to find an equivalent between the source and target languages, but the equivalent is out of context, resulting in different messages. This kind of translation technique results in low-quality translation. The next translation technique is modulation. It shifts a point of view or cognitive perspective of a text. Modulation maintains the same message in the source language but is expressed differently. Generalization and particularization. Generalization is a translation technique that finds an equivalent of a term in the source language into a more general term in the target language.

On the other hand, particularization is a translation technique that looks for an equivalent term in the source language into a more specific term in the target language. Reduction serves as an umbrella for other translation techniques possessing similar concepts, namely deletion, implicitation, and reduction. Deletion is the whole omission from a text. Reduction is a translation technique that omits some parts of a text. Implicitation is a translation technique that makes one of the aspects of text implicit. It is the opposite of explicitation. The next translation technique is transposition. It is a translation technique that changes a lingual unit of the source text into a different lingual unit in the target text. There are two types of transposition, namely rank-shift, and class-shift. Rank-shift is the shift from a linguistic unit, either word into phrases or clauses into sentences and the opposite.

In comparison, class-shift is the shift of word class from one-word class into others, for instance, from nouns into verbs, adjectives into adverbs, etc. The next is borrowing. There are two types of borrowing, namely pure borrowing and naturalized borrowing. Pure borrowing is a translation technique that borrows a term from the source language in its entirety and without any translation changes. Naturalized borrowing is a translation technique that borrows a term from the source language with some adjustments in sound and spellings following those that prevailed in the target language.

### **3. Method**

#### **3.1. Research design**

This research used a research design with a translation case study. A case study was employed since this research studied three novels written by Pramoedya Ananta Toer that have been published and translated into English, namely *Anak Semua Bangsa (Child of All Nations)*, *Rumah Kaca (House of Glass)*, dan *Jejak Langkah (Footsteps)*. Pramoedya Ananta Toer is an Indonesian writer who is famous for his resistance to gaps in the social class system in the society, especially in the Javanese society. Even the three novels studied now are his well-known works since they describe misery caused by social classes during the colonialism era, especially the one dealing with the social class binding the Javanese people. Based on this fact, it is not surprising that many more phenomena of social class discrimination brought up in the three novels

are found. These novels were chosen since they carry a theme triggering discussions and debates among the readers worldwide, such as struggles against social class discrimination. This kind of theme certainly does not only occur in the Javanese community life but also on the global scale.

### 3.2. Techniques of data collection and data analysis

To obtain data, we made in-depth observations against the three novels. First, we explored expressions containing social class discrimination in the novels, either in the source or the target language, such as marginalization, subordination, stereotype, violence, and workload. The next step was that the expert informants and raters diversified the data amounting to 3 persons. It is aimed at conforming perceptions through Focus Group Discussion. This FGD is intended to make data not only accurate but also reliable. After being diversified, the authors and the raters determined the translation techniques adopted by the translators in translating the ST into the TT. In this case, the quantification of the percentage was also conducted to help explain the linguistic phenomenon that occurred. Then, the data analysis was thematically conducted using Handayani's (2006) concept of social class discrimination and Molina & Albir's (2002) translation techniques.

## 4. Findings

### 4.1. Type of social class discrimination

From the research results, it is reported there are 227 data identified as social class discrimination expressions in the novels *Anak Semua Bangsa* (*Child of All Nations*), *Rumah Kaca* (*House of Glass*), and *Jejak Langkah* (*Footsteps*). The depiction of the main and supporting characters was used to describe facts and social realities encountered. In this case, Pram portrays the social facts and then pours them into a story. The explanation of the types of discrimination in the three novels is presented in Table 1.

**Table 1. Expressions of social class discrimination**

No	Type of discrimination	frequency	Percentage
1	Subordination	146	64,18%
2	Stereotype View	59	25,99%
3	Marginalization	16	7,05%
4	Violence	6	2,64%
	Total	227	100%

Table 1 showcases that the form of the social class discrimination most frequently happens is subordination, followed by stereotype, marginalization, and violence.

#### 4.1.1. Subordination

Subordination is a form of discrimination regarding a social group being higher than others. Subordination often appears in the form of inter-social class gaps. The example 1 is presented examples of data showing social class discrimination.

Example 1.

*Do you think that the Dutch and their descendants are proper as your wife?*

Data (1) is an expression from Minke's mother to Minke in the novel *Jejak Langkah* (footsteps). Minke is the main character in the three novels examined. He was a Raden Mas (peerage which is automatically inherent in Javanese aristocratic man), a

son of a regent. However, he is depicted as a different figure from most other *priyayis* (elite people). Minke was a young Javanese man growing to hate Javanese cultures, especially social class issues. He admired the white skin culture's concept of equal rights, obligations, and egalitarianism. Minke preferred medical school to become the successor of his father. That is why he always glorified western cultures. The statement by Minke's mother in the data is an insinuation and a warning for Minke. The expression contains social class discrimination under the type of subordination. From the expression, it is known that in his perspective, he preferred the Dutch and their descendants because they possessed higher education. Although Minke hated such a social class division, in this case, he still thought that the Dutch and their descendants were better in terms of educational factors. The assumption that the Dutch and their descendants were better from the educational aspect, so they are proper to be his wife is a form of social class subordination.

#### 4.1.2. Stereotypical View

A stereotypical view is a form of social class discrimination giving a label that tends to be negative to a certain social group. This labeling harms the group since it makes the group possess a negative stigma from society. For instance:

Example 2:

*You are an educated indigenous person. If they are, the indigenous people are uneducated. You should make them educated.*

Jean Marais made the expression (2), Minke's friend, to Minke in the novel *Anak Semua Bangsa* (Child of All Nations). Minke is a productive writer expressing a lot of ideas in Dutch. According to Minke, educatedness and the Dutch are inseparable. He preferred expressing his ideas in Dutch, and most of his writings are read by people with good mastery of Dutch. But, Jean Marais, an Indo descendant, had another opinion. According to Marais, Minke should pour his ideas out in Malay so that indigenous people, his nation, could understand his ideas. It is Minke's job, according to Jean Marais, who should make his nation more educated. This expression also showed a stereotype expressing that indigenous people were uneducated at that time. The social class discrimination was still maintained and defended even by the educated indigenous people considering that Malay, the indigenous people's language, was the second-class language and was merely used by the uneducated.

#### 4.1.3. Marginalization

Marginalization is a form of social class discrimination that excommunicates or marginalizes a certain group in society. The marginalization also hinders or refuses certain groups to be involved in the community activities. Example 3 presents examples of data showing social class discrimination in the form of marginalization.

Example 3:

**"Who has permitted you to come in here?"**

When entering a billiard house in a city he had just visited, an officer of Indo descent refused Pangemanan. Pangemanan, with his native face, was forbidden to enter the entertainment place special for Europeans and Indo descendants. He was greatly angry since he should get certain treatment as a colonial government employee and be given a place equal to the white. The officer pronounced the expression from Indo descendant to Pangemanan. The expression clearly contains social class

discrimination. It marginalized those coming from indigenous people, people who were considered the lowest class in the society in the colonial era.

#### 4.1.4. Violence

The violence referred to in social class discrimination points not only to physical but also to non-physical violence, for example, cheating in the economic field, the use of harsh words, and so on. Violence often occurs due to gaps in the social class in society. Example 4 illustrates one of the realities of violence as a form of social class discrimination.

Example 4:

*Arbitrary treatment in train company, estate, governor's offices....*

Example (4) is an expression in the form of criticism conveyed by Minke. During the colonial period, the common people were arbitrarily treated by either the colonial government or the indigenous government. This occurred in almost all sectors of life at that time, such as in society, workplaces, and others. The example shows that workers who were common people were treated swiftly by their bosses at their workplaces, such as at train companies, estate, and governor's offices. The arbitrary treatments were often demonstrated in the unfair payroll system and imprudent workload so that the workers seemed like laborers, with different treatments between one worker and another in the workplace. Those are the forms of violence constituting a form of social class discrimination.

## 4.2. Translation techniques in the form of social class discrimination

**Table 2.** Translation techniques in translating expressions of social class discrimination

No	Translation Techniques	Frequency	Percentage
1	Established Equivalence	879	64.63%
2	Modulation	148	10.88%
3	Explicitation	140	10.29%
4	Implication	39	2.86%
5	Paraphrase	34	2.50%
6	Transposition	33	2.42%
7	Pure Borrowing	21	1.54%
8	Addition	18	1.32%
9	Reduction	16	1.17%
10	Generalization	11	0.80%
11	Discursive creation	7	0.51%
12	Compensation	6	0.44%
13	Particularization	4	0.29%
14	Description	2	0.14%
15	Variant borrowing	1	0.07%
16	Deletion	1	0.07%
	Total	1360	100%

#### 4.2.1. Established Equivalence

It is a translation technique that tries to produce an equivalent of a linguistic unit in the source language into another linguistic unit commonly used in the target language. The followings are examples of the use of this translation technique in the data.

Example 5:

SL: *Naik trem pun memilih kelas putih. Kelas satu!*

TL: *He even travels in "white class" – first class.*

'Kelas satu' refers to the highest social strata in society. This term is also often used to refer to the best facilities that can be enjoyed at a high price. These facilities can be merely enjoyed by rich people or those with high societal positions. The data show that the first-class possess the same meaning as the white or the European citizen class. The first class referred to in the data is a tram car class that European citizens usually rode in. 'Kelas satu' is the translation of the term 'first-class.' The translation of the term is the one that is commonly used in English. It also refers to the highest social class or the best societal facility. This translation is the common equivalent of the term in the source language since it has the same meaning.

#### 4.2.2. Modulation

Modulation is a translation technique that changes the SL's point of view or cognition in the TL. The followings have presented some examples of the translation using this translation technique.

Example 6:

SL: *Penduduknya jelas tak dapat diajak bicara soal organisasi modern.*

TL: *It was clear that I could not ask these people to discuss the issue of a modern organization.*

The expression in the SL is presented in the passive voice, indicating that the population in a certain area cannot be invited to talk about a modernity issue by the speaker. On the other hand, the translation of the expression This change is one of the points of view from active to passive voice at the sentence level. This translation technique is often adopted in larger linguistic units such as clauses and sentences.

#### 4.2.3. Explication

It is a translation technique that finds an equivalent for a source language unit with a more explicit form in the translation. In other words, explication is also done to make implicit messages in the source language are also used to make explicit ones in the target language. The following is an example of the use of this translation technique in the data.

Example 7:

SL: *Demi nurani intelektual, Tuan, bukan moral, yang dua-duanya tidak ada pada pihak Pribumi.*

TL: *To satisfy their intellect, my friend Minke, not their morality, neither of which Natives have anyway.*

The term 'Tuan' in the source language refers to the listener *kita*. This term is used to address or refer to the respected listener. This term is implicit in terms of



reference. It means that any respected person will be referred to using this term. This addressing word is translated by making it explicit, namely 'my friend Minke'. There are some reasons why this explicitation is adopted by the translator. One of them is that the addressing word 'tuan' seems to heighten the listener and to lower the one saying it. In the egalitarian western culture, this kind of addressing is less acceptable. Therefore, the translator seems to decide to use the reference of this addressing as his translation.

#### 4.2.4. *Implication*

Implication is a translation technique where the message explicitly conveyed in the source language is changed into the implicit one in its translation. It is the reverse of the explicitation. The objective of explicitation is to refine an expression in the translation or to make a sentence more effective and efficient.

Example 8:

SL: *priyayilah golongan Pribumi paling maju, yang paling berpengetahuan.*

TL: *it is the priyayi who are most educated and most advanced.*

The phrase 'golongan pribumi' emerges explicitly in the source language as a group described by the speaker. In its translation, the phrase is not explicitly expressed. The phrase is made to be implicit in its translation. The omission is implicit, namely, it does not delete but implies it. The phrase's meaning still exists, although it appears implicitly in the translation. This certainly may still be understood by the target readers dealing with which group is being described.

#### 4.2.5. *Paraphrase*

Paraphrasing is a translation technique conveying messages of the source language using a different language and way. This technique is almost similar to modulation but it is freer. In modulation, what is changed is the point of view or its conveyance cognition, whereas, in paraphrase, it is not bound by the stipulation or is freer. Paraphrasing is adopted to make the message more clearly understandable to its target readers.

Example 9:

SL: *Saf-saf sesuai dengan martabat dan jabatan.*

TL: *They were all seated in rows according to their rank.*

This case is also the same as the previous one. The source language focuses on the expression namely, the seat in a row is arranged based on dignity and position. In the translation, the subject is presented as the focus. It is conducted to enable the translation to be more easily understood and greatly accepted by the target readers.

#### 4.2.6. *Transposition*

Transposition is a translation technique that changes a unit's grammatical structure by maintaining the same message. Transposition consists of two types. First, is the word-class shift. Second, rank shift. The following is given an example of transposition adopted in the data.

Example 10:

SL: *Mereka tidak punya hak untuk mencurigai.*

TL: *Peasants had no right to be suspicious.*

It is an example of transposition with the type of word-class shift. The word 'mencurigai' is a 'verb' translated into 'suspicious', an 'adjective' in the target language. Using the adjective in the target language is more acceptable and natural than maintaining the 'verb' form. So it is that makes transposition here obligatory to avoid oddity in translation.

#### 4.2.7. Pure Borrowing

Pure borrowing is a type of borrowing that maintains the intact form of the source language without any change. It always preserves the message in its entirety but sometimes, it may make it difficult for the target readers to understand its meaning.

Example 11:

SL: *Dia hanya seorang Singkeh, Nyai.*

TL: *He was just a Chinese, Nyai.*

In this case, pure borrowing is adopted at the greatly cultural addressing term. The word 'nyai' is a Javanese term used to refer to a respected and married adult listener. Therefore, this term is borrowed into the translation due to a proper equivalent in the target language representing this message. Certainly, this borrowing will enrich the repertoire of cultural knowledge of the target readers.

#### 4.2.8. Addition

Addition is a translation technique that adds information to clear up a unit of the source language. The addition of this information does not add the message.

Example 12:

SL: *Gundik dilihat dengan mata setengah terpicung, lebih tinggi sedikit dari sundal. Kenyataan jadi lain bila digundik orang asing. Mama di Surabaya sendiri sudah membuktikan diri sebagai wanita dengan kedudukan sosial tinggi, lebih tinggi daripada wanita yang kawin sah.*

TL: *Like everywhere else, people here looked at mistresses somewhat askance. They were considered to be only slightly higher than prostitutes. Except, of course, if you were taken as a mistress by a foreigner. Nyai Ontosoroh in Surabaya had been able to prove herself to have a high social status, higher than a woman who was legally married.*

The additional information 'as everywhere else' is an addition intended to make a general comparison. It emphasizes that the fact presented in the sentence may also exist everywhere. This addition is done to either clarify or strengthen messages. However, it does not change any aspects of its meaning. Even it facilitates the target readers to understand the content.

#### 4.2.9. Reduction

Unlike implicitation, the reduction in the message content in the translation text decreases. This often happens because the translator inadvertently or intentionally reduces the meaning because it is too taboo or inappropriate with the rules in the target language.

Example 13:

SL: *"Soalnya: dia berstatus Totok Eropa, Ezekiel Yahudi."*

TL: *"Why? Because Suurhof has European status."*

The aspect deleted in the translation from the source language, in this case, is the phrase 'Ezekiel Yahudi'. Ezekiel Yahudi refers to the Jewish prophets. This expression is aimed at insinuating European descent. In the source language culture, the word 'Jewish' often possesses a negative connotation, so it is used to curse. It seems that the translator knew this, so he decided to omit the phrase in the translation since there are many Jews that will become the target readers of this translation. This omission was intentionally done since the translator understood the risk. But, since the alternative was worse, she made a reduction.

#### 4.2.10. Generalization

Generalization is a translation technique that changes a term in the source language into a more generic one in the target language. It is often adopted when the translator cannot find a term equivalent to the one in the source language. Moreover, it may also be conducted since the equivalent of the term in question is not commonly used.

Example 14:

SL: *Bagaimana mungkin seorang dokter jawa naik gerbong kelas satu?*

TL: *How is it possible for a doctor to travel first class?*

'Dokter Jawa' refers explicitly to a Javanese doctor. It is greatly vital to express since it contains discrimination of one's rights. Unfortunately, the term is generalized into mere 'doctor' in the translation. Even the information of 'Javanese' results in worse discrimination because Javanese's position was considered lower than that of the European nation at that time. Using a generic form in this translation risks reducing the message conveyed. It seems that the discrimination which is intended to reveal has shifted. From the Javanese class, he becomes a doctor.

#### 4.2.11. Discursive creation

It is a translation technique that looks for an equivalent of a language unit in the source language with the one out of context in the target language. It is even different from the message contained in the source language. In short, discursive creation is made by the translator himself instead of based on the information obtained from the source language.

Example 15:

SL: *Darahku mendidih, seorang bandit busuk berani bicara begitu sembrono terhadap seorang pejabat.*

TL: *My blood boiled that a rotten bandit like this dared speak so loudly to an official.*

A rotten bandit is depicted as speaking "haphazardly" to an official in the source language. Haphazard means speaking carelessly or not considering the impacts of one's utterance on others. This word is translated into 'so loudly' in the target language. The translation contains impolite meaning, but the aspect that the bandit thinks carelessly and haphazardly is not conveyed. The translation is the translator's creation and misinterpretation in this context.

#### 4.2.12. Compensation

Compensations is a translation technique that moves the position of a unit in the source language into other positions in the sentence in the target language to reach its acceptability and stylistic aspects.

Example 16:

SL: *pada umumnya* golongannya menganggap Pribumi lebih rendah.

TL: *her people generally* looked down upon Natives.

The adverbial phrase 'pada umumnya' in the source language is located at the beginning of the sentence. This shows that the emphasis of this sentence is on the adverb 'pada umumnya'. This adverbial phrase 'generally' is moved into the position after the subject in the translation text. It means that the emphasis of the translation is the subject. However, this stylistic emphasis does not change any message except the stylistic aspect of the sentence.

#### 4.2.13. Particularization

It is a translation technique that is the opposite of generalization. Instead, particularization finds the equivalent of a unit in the source language with a more specific term in the target language. This translation technique is adopted when there is no proper equivalent of a term in the source language or when the translator intends to avoid a specific term in the source language that is unacceptable in the target language. Moreover, particularization aims to clarify the context of an utterance or an expression.

Example 17:

SL: "Hanya *anak dusun* busuk berkopor lebih busuk semacam ini."

TL: "Only a rottenest village *boy* would bring a rotten case like this."

The sentence's subject in the source language is 'anak dusun'. In the source text, when this expression occurred, who was involved in the exchange was a boy fighting in the dormitory, so it is clear that what is meant by 'anak' here contextually was 'boy.' In the translation, the word 'anak' becomes explicitly 'boy' based on the context of the incidence and those involved in the event when the expression was made.

#### 4.2.14. Description

It is a translation technique explaining the intention or the description of a term in the source language. This technique is used to facilitate the target readers to understand the translation more easily, and it is caused by the fact that one-to-one correspondence of a term is not found in the target language.

Example 18:

SL: Mendengar namaku ia bersimpuh *menyembah* seperti seorang hamba-sahaya.

TL: When he found out who I was, he *fell to the floor to make obeisance* as if he were my slave or servant.

In this sentence, the word 'menyembah' means saluting the king or the people with higher positions by sitting on the floor while bowing one's head and raising hands parallel to the head. This procession is often conducted when one is facing Javanese kings or their officials. This term is different from the concept of 'worshiping' God. This term does not possess any appropriate equivalent in the target language since it is a specific term for Javanese cultural activities. As a result, the translator chose to describe the meaning of this word in the target language as 'fell to the floor to make obeisance'.

#### 4.2.15. Variant borrowing

This translation technique describes a concept where a term in the source language is translated into the target language using a term in another language (the

third language). It is named 'X' since there is no concept in the translation technique theorizing this case.

Example 19:

SL: "*Eropa datang berdagang kemari, Tuan, tapi menjauhkan dirinya dari Pribumi.*"

TL: "*The Europeans came here for trade, Meneer, but always distanced themselves from the Natives.*"

The word 'Tuan' is a term in the source language used to address a hearer with much higher social status than the first speaker. This term is equivalent to a term in Dutch 'Meneer' when it is translated. This term has been used since the Dutch colonialists then, and the Dutch officials were usually addressed using this term. However, since this term is not English, it cannot be stated as an established equivalent. Therefore, this phenomenon is categorized as variant borrowing, a term from other languages besides the source and the target languages.

#### 4.2.16. Deletion

It is a translation technique that omits all messages, a unit in the source language is not translated into the target language. Many factors are causing such deletion in translation. This translation technique is adopted because the translator intentionally omits it due to the sensitiveness factor of the unit in translation. Another reason is inadvertence, or the translator fails to find a good equivalent on the unit that should be translated.

Example 19:

SL: *Di jaman modern barangsiapa tidak mendapat pendidikan Eropa akan tinggal jadi pencangkul.*

TL: -----

The translator does not translate the expression of social class discrimination above. Therefore, one intact expression is omitted. This deletion greatly affects the loss of important messages intended to be expressed by the writer of the source text.

## 5. Discussion

The findings showcase that the expressions of social class discrimination encompass subordination, stereotypical perspective, marginalization, and violence. Meanwhile, the most dominant social class discrimination is subordination. Subordination is a form of discrimination that considers a group socially higher than others. The Dutch colonial group considered that their social status and power were higher than those of the indigenous people. They also thought they were cleverer and more intelligent than the indigenous people experiencing backwardness. Whereas what they assumed was not necessarily correct. Indigenous people did not surely experience educational backwardness as the Dutch colonialists. Indigenous people did not certainly possess lower social status than the Dutch colonialists. Mohammad Hatta, Soekarno, and other prominent national figures could also prove that they were educated and studied in Dutch schools. The subordination issue emerges due to some reasons. The first is the social construction issue. Theodorson & Theodorson (1979) revealed that this discrimination treatment does not come naturally, but it is based on the wrong perception of the Dutch colonialists of indigenous people having different backgrounds. The Dutch colonialists had higher incomes, education, and jobs than the

indigenous people (Kathleen, 2017). The second is the philosophy of life inherent in a specific group.

Zionist Jewish community groups adhere to the racist supremacy philosophy (racial/ethnic group superiority/conceit). This philosophy teaches that they are God's chosen man. Therefore, other ethnic groups should be under their orders. In America, *white supremacy* is one of the principles of American life. *White supremacy* refers to an ideology that the white race is superior to others. White supremacy is much related to anti-black and anti-semitism racism. However, it is widely used to justify discrimination against natives of America, Chinese, Irish, and the South East, for instance, apartheid in South Africa. The development of this white supremacy continues in Western cultures and is the subject of many debates. White supremacy is sometimes used to mark a philosophical belief considering that white people are superior to others and rule over or even can destroy them. Playing favor in developing areas inhabited by white people and *people of color in America occurred*. The development in Manhattan and New York cities seemed imbalanced between *downtown, midtown, and uptown*. *Downtown* and *midtown* are luxurious, with business centers and plush apartments. But, *uptown*, which Afro-Africa and Hispanics generally settle, seems slum. The struggle made by black citizens in the 60s era was a living witness of the tendency of racialism in America. Under the command of extraordinary people, like Martin Luther Jr, Malcolm X, and others, Afro-American people rose to fight in a peaceful (*non-violent*) way. This struggle bore fruit. More than eight years ago, it was for the first time that an Afro-American was elected as the President of America. Barack Obama is considered the crystallization of the *civil rights movement* or struggles to get civil rights. This occurs since the American Constitution clearly and strictly ensures equality and *justice for all*. Still, this superiority tendency becomes the main obstacle to implementing constitutional idealism. This phenomenon implies that the social class discrimination under the subordination issue still continues throughout human life. However, this issue cannot be solved by enforcing justice for all. In the context of education, this research implies that an educator should be conscious of social class discrimination and so should be avoided it. He should not discriminate amongst his students since they come from various social classes

Likewise, the present research results showed that the translation technique 'established equivalent' is dominantly adopted. It means that the translator successfully transfers messages from the source language into the target language. Namely, the message of the social class discrimination from the source language is parallel to and equivalent with the message of the social class discrimination in the target language. It is in line with Molina and Albir's (2002) outlook that the use of a term that has been commonly used in the target language surely may improve the accuracy of the message. But, the accuracy level of the message does not reach 100 percent since discursive creation, reduction, and deletion which may reduce the accuracy level of the message, are also found.

## 6. Conclusion

The social class discrimination subordination issue will continue throughout human life since it is related to the principle of life of a community group that cannot be negotiated. For instance, the Zionist Jewish community group adheres to the racist supremacy philosophy and American citizens comply with white supremacy. This

means that the Jewish community will regard themselves as God's best creation since they are under the group of chosen human beings. Similarly, American white citizens think they are the better community group than black citizens. The philosophy and the principle of life are strengthened by the research results showing that subordination is a form of the most dominant social class discrimination, namely 64.18%, and followed by the sub-discrimination of social classes such as stereotypical view, 25.99%, marginalization, 7.05% and violence, 2.64%. Likewise, this research results also reported that there are 16 translation techniques identified namely established equivalent 64, 63%, modulation 10, 88%, explicitation 10,29%, implicitation 2,86%, paraphrase 2,50%, transposition 2,42%, pure borrowing 1,54%, addition 1,32%, reduction 1,17%, generalization 0,80%, discursive creation 0,51%, compensation 0,44%, particularization 0,29%, description 0,14%, variant borrowing 0,07%, and deletion 0,07%. This present research certainly has some limitations, among others, the limitation is the research object. This research object is limited to the social class discrimination issue and it does not discuss other discrimination that may also exist in the novels, such as gender discrimination. Similarly, this present research merely discusses how other social class discrimination is translated, without relating it to other variables, such as translation quality, translation method, and translation ideology. It is because a translation technique does not stand alone. A translation technique in a micro scale is certainly related to a translation method in a mesoscale and translation ideology in a macro scale. The use of a translation technique influences the translation quality. Therefore, future research should be conducted by studying the relation between translation technique and method, translation ideology and translation quality with different discrimination objects, namely gender discrimination.

## References

- Alves, J. A. (2014). From necropolis to blackpolis: Necropolitical governance and black spatial praxis in São Paulo, Brazil. *Antipode*, 46(2), 323-339.
- Archer, J., & Lloyd, B. (2002). *Sex and gender*. Cambridge University Press.
- Billiet, J., & De Witte, H. (2008). Everyday racism as predictor of political racism in Flemish Belgium. *Journal of Social Issues*, 64(2), 253-267.
- Billiet, J., E. Jaspaert, and M. Swyngedouw. (2012). "Diversity in the relationship between perceived ethnic threat, Islamophobia, and (Sub)national identity in Belgium." In *Methods, Theories, and Empirical Applications in the Social Sciences*, edited by S. Salzborn, E. Davidov, and J. Reinecke, 279-289. Wiesbaden: Springer VS.
- Ceuppens, B. (2006). Allochthons, colonizers, and scroungers: Exclusionary populism in Belgium. *African Studies Review*, 147-186.
- Colak, F. Z., Van Praag, L., & Nicaies, I. (2020). 'Oh, this is really great work – especially for a Turk!': a critical race theory analysis of Turkish Belgian students' discrimination experiences. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 1-19.
- Cormack, D., Harris, R., & Stanley, J. (2020). Māori experiences of multiple forms of discrimination: findings from Te Kupenga 2013. *Kōtuitui: New Zealand Journal of Social Sciences Online*, 15(1), 106-122.

- Fiske, Susan T. (1998). Stereotyping, prejudice, and discrimination. In *The Handbook of Social Psychology*, 4th ed., vols. 1 and 2, ed. D. T. Gilbert, Fiske, and G. Lindzey. New York: McGraw-Hill. 357-411.
- Greenland, K., Augoustinos, M., Andreouli, E., & Taulke-Johnson, R. (2020). Cross-group friendships, the irony of harmony, and the social construction of "discrimination". *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 43(7), 1169-1188.
- Jodonytė & Morkienė (2001). Studies about language. *Kalbu Studijos*, 1(1), 48-51.
- Handayani, T., Sugiarti, & Dharma, S. (2006). *Konsep dan teknik: penelitian gender*. Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang (UMM) Press.
- Heath, A. F., and Y. Brinbaum, eds. (2014). "Unequal Attainments: Ethnic Educational Inequalities in Ten Western Countries." Proceedings of the British Academy 196. Oxford: Published for the British Academy for Oxford University Press.
- Hordge-Freeman, E. 2015. *The Color of Love: Racial Features, Stigma, and Socialization in Black Brazilian Families*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Kopkin, N., & Mitchell-Walthour, G. (2020). Color discrimination, occupational prestige, and skin color in Brazil. *Latin American and Caribbean Ethnic Studies*, 15(1), 44-69.
- Layton, M. L., & Smith, A. E. (2017). Is it race, class, or gender? The sources of perceived discrimination in Brazil. *Latin American politics and society*, 59(1), 52-73.
- Masequesmay, G. (2014). Negotiating Multiple Identities in. *Queer Theory and Communication: From Disciplining Queers to Queering the Discipline(s)*, 193.
- McGinn, K. L., & Oh, E. (2017). Gender, social class, and women's employment. *Current Opinion in Psychology*, 18, 84-88.
- Mouzon, D. M., Taylor, R. J., Nguyen, A. W., Ifatunji, M. A., & Chatters, L. M. (2020). Everyday discrimination typologies among older African Americans: gender and socioeconomic status. *The Journals of Gerontology: Series B*, 75(9), 1951-1960.
- Parsons, C. (2019). Social justice, race and class in education in England: Competing perspectives. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 49(3), 309-327.
- Perry, K. (2013). *Black Women against the Land Grab*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Phalet, K., & Heath, A. (2010). From ethnic boundaries to ethnic penalties: Urban economies and the Turkish second generation. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 53(12), 1824-1850.
- Sears, D. O., & Citrin, J. (1985). *Tax revolt: Something for nothing in California*. Harvard: University Press.
- Silva Da, G. M., & Reis, E. P. (2011). Perceptions of racial discrimination among black professionals in Rio de Janeiro. *Latin American Research Review*, 55-78.
- Spencer, N., Urquhart, M. A., & Whitely, P. (2020). Class Discrimination? Evidence from Jamaica: A Racially Homogeneous Labor Market. *Review of Radical Political Economics*, 52(1), 77-95.
- Smith, C. (2016). *Afro-Paradise: Blackness, Violence, and Performance in Brazil*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press.
- Staiano, F. (2015). "Bringing critical race theory to Europe: The case of immigrant women." *European Journal of Legal Studies*, 8(2): 73-96.
- Telles, E. (2004). *Race in Another America: The Significance of Skin Color in Brazil*. Princeton University Press.



- Theodorson, G. A., & Theodorson, A. G. (1969). *A modern dictionary of sociology*. <http://doi/10.2307/588731>.
- Thomas, L., & Wareing, S. (2007). *Language, Society and Power*. In Sunoto, Gatot Sutanto, Imam Suyitno, Suwarna, Sudjalil, Eko Suroso, Siti Halidjah, Darmanto, dan Nuria Reny (Penj). Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Tight, M. (2010). The curious case of case study: a viewpoint. *International journal of social research methodology*, 13(4), 329-339.
- Twine, F. W. (1998). *Racism in a Racial Democracy: The Maintenance of White Supremacy*. Rutgers University Press.
- Wing, A. K., and M. N. Smith. (2008). "Critical race feminism lifts the veil? Muslim women, france, and the Headscarf Ban." SSRN Scholarly Paper ID 1130247. Rochester, NY: Social Science Research Network. <https://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=1130247>.